N.Y.S.D. Case # 21mc100(AKH)

UNITED STATES COURT OF APPEALS FOR THE SE OND CIRCUIT

At a stated Term of the United States Court of Appeals for the Second Circuit, held at the Daniel Patrick Moynihan United States Courthouse, 500 Pearl Street, in the City of New York, on the 11th day of November, two thousand and ten,

In re: World Trade Center Disaster Site Litigation

John Montalvo, Marion S. Mishkin, of counsel Noice of appearance to Sacks & Sacks, Phyllis Costarella, Joseph Falcone, Lenny Dinotte, Cliff Carty, Kathleen Carty, Joseph Scaramuzzino, Kelly M. Miller, Lawrence Ford, Blanca Goffredo, Frank Goffredo, Bernard Stinchcomb, Christine Stinchcomb, Christine Johnson, Robert Johnson, Jr., David Nolan, Louise Nolan, Robert Panarella, Herbert Pate, Francis Lavery, Kathryn Lavery, Arlene McGillick, Jon J. McGillick, Dewardranth Samaroo, Donald Carson, Gloria Elaine Carson, Andrea Cavicchio, Nicola Cavicchio, Jason Porcaro, Robert Ayers, Dean Curti, Jessie K. Horton, Lawrence Horton, Kevin O'Brien, Patricia O'Brien, Susan Medaglia, Diane Hoch Sankey, Lionel Payette, William J. Sankey, Michelle Payette, Jerry O'Connor, Ingrid Quagliariello, Victoria O'Connor, Vincent Quagliariello, John Quinn, Lois Rice, Donald G. Thompson, Frank Silechai, Renee Thompson, Frank Squicciarini, Daniel Leonard, Michelle Squicciarini, Laura Leonard, Anthony Compono, Delia Becca, Sheila Compono, Lance Becca, William Favata, Gregory A. Forsyth, Michele Hardin, John Jackson, Robert Hardin, Tomiann Jackson, Jimmy Rosario, Donna Haskell, Toni Rosario, Frank Haskell, Leonard Schmitt, Christine Placide, Virginia Schmitt, Larrie Placide, John McLees, Ann Marie Duignan, Lenore Rauscher, Patrick Duignan, Philip Rauscher, Michael Macko, John C. Sondey, Jill Miskanic, John Baiano, John Miskanic, John Bonvicino, Andrea McDonough, John Bou, David McDonough, Douglas Anderson, Walter Jensen, Daniel Simon, Thomas Doherty, Theresa Simon, James Checco, Richard Fritz, Judy Checco, Adam J. Vilagos, Jean

ORDER

Docket Number: 10-2765, 10-3172

USDC SDNY
DOCUMENT
ELECTRONICALLY FILED
DOC #:
DATE FILED: September 30, 2011

Imparato, Yvonne Vilagos, Joseph Imparato, George Morales, Lane Metro, Charles Piotrowski, Nancy Metro, Marguerite Piotrowski, Kevin Farrell, Joseph Accetta, Concetta Zuccaro, Sharon Accetta, John Zuccaro, Frank Gulotta, James Albach, Geraldine Martin, Michael Bell, John McArdle, Police Officer, Shirley Bell, Barbara McArdle, John Boyle, Barbara Melendez, Christine Broome, Edna I. Muniz, Robert Broome, Raul Muniz, Maryann Bubelnik, Christine Pagliuca, Thomas J. Bubelnik, Brian Madden, Barry Buss, Maxine Madden, Jeanette Buss, Joseph Pagliuca. Anthony Devita, Dennis Keane, Laranie Devita, Lisa Keane, Diane Donovan, Kenneth Peppei, Kenneth Donovan, Rhonda Peppei, Danielle Eivers, Dino Polichetti, Detective, Joseph Eivers, June Polichetti, Gregory Forsyth, Auying Rivera, Robert Gallagher, Maureen Rodriguez, Rosario Gallagher, Linda Scharp, Robert Garett, William Scharp, Carol Gavitt, Heidi Scheiner, Joseph Gavitt, Joseph Scotti, Lisa Scotti, Thomas Gillam, Steven Stefanakos, Francesca Gillam, Patricia Hawkins, Ann Towpash, Scott Hawkins, Robert Tucker, Anna Maria Hubner, Eric Wuss, Vincent Hubner, Staci Wuss, Barbara Kadnar, Mary DeSimone, James A. Kadnar, Joseph DeSimone, Derek Kelly, Annette Misichia, Catherine Lang, Frank Misichia, James Lang, Allison Poliseno, Caroline Lavin, Nicholas Poliseno, Michael Lavin, Charles Rice, Alfred Luchetti, Jeffrey Rivera, Mary Ellen Luchetti, Kenneth Rodriguez, Frank Malone, Kevin Mongiello, Dennis McConville, Kevin Brannick, Gail McConville, Wayne Brown, James McHugh, Robert Carannante, Margret McHugh, Victor Carpentier, Kenneth Miccio, Alan Ceserano, Cathy Mongiello, Michael Conlon, Kevin Mongiellop, Phyliss Costarella, Laura Morello, Gerald Damitz, Marc Morello, Anthony Delbianco, Mathew Mulham, Lenny Dinotte, Corinne Mulham, Daniel Donovan, Carolyn Mundy, Roy Edwards, Thomas Mundy, Nelson Garcia, Joseph Murphy, Anthony Girodano, Nancy Murphy, Robert Goffredo, Maureen Nogan, Rafael Gutierrez, Richard Nogan, Otto HAvell, III, John Quevedo, Robert Henri, Alfred Retundie, Austin C. Johnson, Carol Retundie, Omar Malave, Alice Rivera, John Menoni, Vincent Rivera, Mickey Nardiello, Donald Striffler, Frank Ozello, Mary Jane Striffler, Thomas Perry, John Tiska, Juan Rullan, Robert

Van Houten, Thomas Perry, Robin Van Houten, Raymond Russo, Andrea Weisenburger, George Snyder, Gregg Weisenburger, Alexis Solomon, Michael Welsh, John Pankey, Theresa Welsh, Rafael Garcia, individually and as representatives of a class of individuals similarly situated, John J. Quinn, Attorney, John Lombardi, individually and as representatives of a class of individuals similarly situated, Kenneth J. Strohl, Hasan A. Muhammad, individually and as representatives of a class of individuals similarly situated, Yajaira Strohl, Roberto Ramos, Jr., individually and as representatives of a class of individuals similarly situated, Arlene Montalvo, Michael R. Basile, Richard Mighdoll, Thomas E. Carlstrom, Colleen Ryan, Kathy O'Neill, J. Richard Ryan, Robert O'Neill, Richard Ryan, Telma Alvarado, Frank Maisano, Robert Asinelli, Julie Maisano, Susan Asinelli, Arthur S. Davis, Carol Barnes, Theresa A. Davis, James S. Barnes, Jo Andrusyczyn, Daniel Danzi, Stanley Andrusyczyn, Gabriel Masaracchia, Hector Rivera, Sharon Danzi, Joseph Bellissimo, John DiFalco, Carl Fisher, Dorothy Rohr, Jon Marie Fisher, Nancy DiFalco, Patrick Donaghy, John Rohrbeck, Susan Allison, Agustin Diaz, Richard Allison, Daniel Doll, Juan Cubero, Lisa Doll, Rosa Cubero, John Glynn, Jeanne Kolarik, Mary Glynn, Mark Bernheimer, Sharon Sellick, Arthur Alessandro, Gary Grisolia, John Delaney, Joseph Aridzzone, Patrick D'Alliegro, Joann Grisolia, John Botte, Bruce Groth, Cynthia Shelto, Donna Groth, Allen Andersen, Charles Haver, Sue Ann Andersen, Lori Haver, Cecelia Borcherding, Jo Ann Lavery, Stephen Borcherding, Manuel Luna, Marcia Diaz, Jessica Macaluso, William Diaz, Daniel Mahlmann, Charles La Barbera, Tracey L. Mahlmann, Catherine Langerin, Bryan McElwain, Philip J. Pfersching, Felicia McElwain, Kevin Reynolds, Carolyn McGuire, Lisa Reynolds, Robert McGuire, Joseph Cardinale, Jane McKenna, Teresita Cayatano, John McKenna, Robert Intartaglia, Joann MCMahon, Christopher Romanski, John MCMahon, Raymond Fuscaldo, Sharon Brenseke, Donna Donnelly, Steven Brenseke, Dorothy Foris, Christine Comerford, George Foris, John Comerford, Jacqueline Cacchioli, Edward Donnelly, Louie Cacchioli, Linda Donnelly, Patricia Aguglairo, James Fusco, Anthony Agugliaro, John

Mills, Alfred Gaillard, Margaret Mills, Ernest Medaglia, Jennifer Morales, Nicholas Morales, Adilline Navarro, Felix Navarro, Martin Olsen, Kumarie Rampersad, Sunil Rampersad, Willie Richardson, Donald O. Thompson, Majorie Thompson, Michael Clarke, Vienna Clarke, John Dadabo, Lorraine Dadabo, Adam Lutfi, Elliott Miller, Nicole Lutfi, Joseph Nacarlo, Loan Murray, Pamela Nacarlo, Errol Rampersad, Parbatee Rampersad, Boroido Rivera, Jennifer Roberts, Desmond Loughran, Jean Vasconi, Emil Borg, Maylee Borg, Patrick Holahan, Susan Holahan, Emily Puppa, Glenn Puppa, Ursula Hubert, Michael Hurbert, Catherine Keir, James Keir, Cindy Mastrota, Frank Mastrota, Frank Mastrota, George Faller, Kathleen Faller, Michael Crowell, Ada R. Aparicio, Robert Murray, Joseph Aparicio, Donald Bigi, Donna J. Bigi, Andrew F. Carson, Bonnie M. Carson, Lawrence Coleman, Peggy Coleman, Christine Duval, Keith Duval, James Griffin, Jennifer Griffin, Celeste Haas, Scott Haas, Brian Hearn, Kathleen Hearn, Debra Huhn Hewson, Michael Hewson, Mary Ellen Lanigan, Michael Lynch, Tina Lynch, Michael Brigante, Steve Cappello, Paul Carpenteri, John Kear, Christopher O'Rourke, Salvatore Palmeri, Wendy Henry, Joseph Leahy, Sandra Leahy, Allison Edwards, William Edwards, Patrick Arcese, Carlos Perez, James Cooney, Samuel Provisero, Susan Marie Provisero, Denise Esposito, Robert Esposito, Doug R. Horning, James Kelly, Benito Berrios, Jr., Chaundolyne Mack, Debra Maggiani, Nabil Hussain, Michael Giganti, Josehine Damato, Michael Damato, Carmen Fernandez, Joseph Nolan, Police Officer, Lana Nolan, Mickey McFarland, Elaine Wint, Helen Mulcahey, Catherine Siano, Thomas Siano, Karen L. Simpson, William Simpson, Correction, James A. Howard, Elizabeth Stewart, Richard Maiorino, James Monahan, Police Officer, John Urso, William Schillinger, Kathy Slizewski, Kenneth Slizewski, Alfred MacDonald, Kelly Macdonald, Lori McPartland, Michael McPartland, Edgar Mendez, Tasha Mendez, Christopher O'Donnell, Stephanie O'Donnell, Ana Fox, Robert Fox, Christopher Cirino, Donna Cirino, Martin Kelly, Shane Dresser, Patrick McVey, Christopher Misciagna, Ellen Collins, Debra Curcio, Peter Curcio, Patricia M. DiGiovanni, Kathleen Fullam, James Fullam, Jacqueline Miller, James Miller,

James Mullen, Trustee, Kim Mullen, John Murphy, Suzanne Murphy, Dan Potter, Jean Potter, James Service, Rebecca Service, John Condon, Cynthia Vitera, Christopher Lavin, Dawn D'Agostino, Philip D'Agostino, Bozena Kajewska-Pielarz, Joesf Pielarz, Christine Panarella, Michael Panarella, Andrew Scallo, Diane Scallo, Maureen Colgan, Patrick J. Colgan, John R. O'Keefe, Sandra O'Keefe, Khemraj Singh, Antonio Martino, Nicole Martino, James Baumann, Richard Bittles, Cesar Bonilla, Joanne Bonilla, Daniel Gilroy, Maureen Gilrov, George Rodriguez, Marguerita Rodriguez, Thomas Callaghan, John Harkins, Police Officer, Kevin Kerrigan, Iris Lopez, Margaret O'Keefe, John Marksp, Lisa Marks, Anthony Marden, Theodore Sergio, Christina Marden, Kathleen Doerler, William Unger, Walter Bieber, Deirdre O'Donnell, Joseph O'Donnell, Allen Akers, Mary Akers, Betty Harrison, Yvonne Leon, Robert Garrett, Karen Labetti, Michael Labetti, Michael Rooney, Penny Rooney, John Rohr, James Melendez, Edward Galanek, Luz Cardona, Elizabeth Connolly, James Connolly, Catherine Musto, Louis Musto, Gerald Quill, Linda Quill, Edward Scharfberg, New York City Police Officer, Marylee Scharfberg, Christine Voce, Gregory Voce, Cora Weihs, Joseph Weihs, Suzanne Worontzoff, Walter Worontzoff, Anna Zecca, George Zecca, Barbara Lopez, Manuel Lopez, Thomas Lennon, Aida Valdiulezo-Nieto, Edward Learning, Victoria Learning, Hamide Cagatay, Zebebulah Cagatay, Jose Calle, Rudolph Geiger, Carolyn Bryson, Robert Mule, Charity Oberdier, Jeffrey Oberdier, Deborah Scotto, Dominick Scotto, Louis Quadrino, Sonia Quadrino, Michael J. Surianello, Frank Danetra, John Warren, Sheryl Warren, Edwin Pagan, Daniel Kemmet, Doell Kemmet, Ferdinand Sanchez, Sanchez Maria, Julia Valentin, William Valentin, Sophie McGill, Mary McGrory, Anthony Heitz, Ruth Marie Heitz, Peter Dalton, William English, Robert McCracken, Chief, Walter Lane, Brian Divis, Christopher Destefano, Anna Patricia Cantos, Richard Saccomagno, Charles Dell'accio, Ilkhah Dell'accio, June Dibetta, John McGill, Robert McGrory, Carl Delgado, Carolyn Cicero, Joseph Cicero, Donna O'Byrne, Michael O'Byrne, Patricia Ryan, Terrence Ryan, Ronald Brandt, Paul Caminiti, Patrick Coleman, Robert Cooke, Thomas Dowdle, Claudette

Cruickshank-Davis, William Collins, Michael Kelley, Dee A. Fraley, Gerald E. Fraley, Joseph Greco, Judy Greco, James Francis, Karina A. Francis, Hector Diaz, Linda Diaz, Scott Dabreu, Michael Divirgilio, Frank Ingenito, Michael Pluchino, Robert Schuman, Jerome Willis, Hector Fernandez, Angie Febres, Christopher Hynes, Leslie Hynes, William Henderson, Maria Henderson, Maryanne Hinchy, George O'Connor, Allison Kapezack, Steven Kapezak, Mary Imbornoni, Thomas Imbornoni, Daisy Ibanez, Diomedes Ibanez, Doreen Kozak, James Knight, Roxanne Knight, Christopher Kuchler, Soojin Kuchler, Carolyn Leibowitz, Leslie Leibowitz, Anthony O'Brien, Patricia O'Brien, Terrance Frontis, Vincent Ligotti, Jay Levine, Maria O'Neill, Thomas O'Neill, Judy Chin, Tommy Chin, Deborah Lonnberg, Ronald Lonnberg, Steve Lovergine, Jerome Kazlauskas, David Andre Liferidge, Patricia Havelka, Rudolf Havelka, Antonio Silva, Esperanza Silva, Diana Trinidad, Edictor Trinidad, Albert Sheppard, Patricia Sheppard, Rosemary Johnson, Stephen Johnson, Geraldine R. Sabatasso, Robert Ryan, Holly Mulhern, Richard Mulhern, Denise Sullivan, Jimmie Sullivan, Joseph Haddock, Zenobia Walji, Mark Lenigan, Jeaan Marie Whelan, Patrick Whelan, Alinda Durkin, John Durkin, Anthony D'Angelo, Laura D'Angelo, Barry Felder, Thomas Glaudino, John Faust, Rosemarie Faust, Charles Wassil, Patricia Wassil, William Luciani, Todd Lum, David Zephrine, Josephine Zephrine, Debra Hutchinson, Don Hutchinson, Michael Hughes, Christine Hutchinson, Robert Hutchinson, Martin Zollner, Imie Zollner, William Mulcahey, Ann Hock, Joseph Hock, James Howard, Elizabeth Stewart, Herbert Stewart, Anna Fittipaldi, Tyrone Lott, John Lonnborg, Susan Woods, Dominick Rutigliano, Joelle Rutigliano, Ann Marie Schilling, Chalres Schilling, Linda Solis, Lucio Solis, Louise McNiece, Patrick McNiece, Frank Farrugia, Karen Farrugia, Frank Farrugia, Kathleen Tracy, Peter Tracy, Richard Passeretti, Richard Maoiorino, Gary Tolesp, Karline Toles, Daniel Magrino, Virginia McGill, Keith McGill, Christopher Murphy, Gary Mangiapia, Paul Mazzilli, James Monahan, Police Officer, Stephanie Urso, Mary Anne Schillinger, William Schillinger, Lori McParland, Michael McParland, Darren Brindisi, Alviri Foster, Pamela Gauci, Hugh Bradshaw, Christopher Greeff,

John Capenito, Kevin Capenito, Alisa Columbia, Chris Columbia, Pete Franzone, Anita Cozza, John Cozza, Luz Botero, Carolyn Cuneo, Cory Cuneo, Daniel Conroy, Suzanne Conroy, Tyrell Anderson, Dominic Bonomonte, Maria Asencio, Luigi Cuffari, Sharon Cuffari, Annabel Baratta, Michael Baratta, Roy Barefield, Sybel Barefield, Christine Cunningham, Michael Cunningham, Patricia Bullen, Thomas Bullen, Christine Corbett, Patrick F. Corbett, Annette Leary, Santy Bermudez, Bridget Cacavio, Thomas Cacavio, Joseph Cowell, Ralph Fragapane, Vera Fragapane, Holly Andersen, Jason Andersen, Gail Corrao, Louis Corrao, Michael Gugielmo, Philomeni Gugielmo, Krista Desimone, Brian Glacken, Maria Cinquemani, Victor Cinquemani, Anthony Giorando, Marisa Giorando, Gerard Gavin, Mary Gavin, Denise Donato, Greg Donato, Maria Criollo, Jose Criollo, Louis Buglione, Winifred Buglione, Louis Gyuris, Nicholas Boscaino, Christine Carver, Thomas Carver, Richard Blasi, Thomas Cooke, Cynthia Cooke, John Antoniades, Anthony Cummo, Christine Cummo, De'Andre Berry, Renee Berry, Ann Cangemie, Emanuel Cangemie, Darren C. Harkins, Robert Castorena, Lorenzo Arellano, Tricia Arellano, Carolyn Bavaro, Anthony Franzolin, Daniel Fernandez, Susan Fernandez, David Pope, Michael Knox, Peter Franzi, James W. Brereton, Sandra Brereton, Leslie Fleming, Robert Fleming, Ann Betro, Louis Betro, Aaron Edelman, R. Delia Mannix, Richard Mannix, Beverly Hovell, Richard Hovell, Charles Maxwell, Debbi Maxwell, Cristine Papasodero, Vincent Papasodero, Brian McGreever, Ileana McGreever, Michael Stacey, Stephanie Stacey, Kevin Martz, Anthony Valletta, Alma I. McCahey, Richard McCahey, Dianne Masino, Louis Masino, Michael Kendrick, Dawn Kirchner, Ronald Kirchner, Dale Pizzo, Frank Pizzo, Jenniffer Schojan, Peter Schojan, Donna-Marie Gullo, Karin Fox-Taitt, Patricia DeJesus, Andre Escalera, Donna Stacey, Louis Stacey, Elisabeth Mancini, Ron Mancini, Enrigue Cruz, Gladys Cruz, Jose Medina, John Lynott, Patricia Lynott, Mike Melillo, Susan Melillo, Erasmo Maddalena, Carolyn Riegert, Russell Riegert, Kerry Smith, Frank Salamone, Jodie Salamone, Ilyes H. Ruiz, David Ruiz, Eileen Moran, James Moran, Catherine Petrella, Michelle Oetting, William Oetting, Silvia Castillo, Richard Sere, Dennis

Healy, Brian Hughes, Kerry Hughes, Anthony Serevino, Lizette Carvajal, Richard Harris, Patricia Mullaney, Regis Mullaney, Flora Priolo, Frank Priolo, Gary Walters, Star Walters, Irene O'Donnell, Charles Langone, Janet Langone, Cheri Rontondi, Mark Rontondi, Elizabeth Ryan, William Ryan, Peter Mladinich, Loretta Mendez, Roy Mendez, Delia Lopez-Stull, Edward Lopez-Stull, Albert Munro, Sandy Munro, Sandra Nemeh, Steven Nemeh, Dara Moore, Francis Moore, Stanislav Salomov, Vera Shalomov, Carmen Quinones, Raphael Quinones, Debra A. Boswell, Robert Boswell, Robert Melendez, Sarita Melendez, Luigi Bruschi, Maria Bruschi, Arlene Feola, Gerald Feola, Dominick Capuano, Megan Capuano, Julie Bruno, Thomas Bruno, Alexander Darmiento, Jessica Darmiento, Donnamarie Nolan, James Nolan, Jennyfer Nagle, John Nagle, Denise Rushmore, Russel Rushmore, Evelyn Ruiz, Juan Ruiz, Andrea Bowles, Donald Bowles, Lamont Daniel, Susan Daniels, Jean Doherty, Kevin Doherty, Julie Camarda, Thomas Camarda, Elizabeth Dwyer, Patrick Dwyer, Michael McDaniel, Sharon McDaniel, Thomas Cruz, Elaine Buirkle, Joseph Buirkle, Kathleen Gannon, Richard Gannon, Lorraine Burke, Marie Neuman, Raymond Neuman, Mariana Ortega, Segundo Ortega, Carmen Ruiz, Edward Irving, Eileen T. Irving, Nancy Regan, Thomas Regan, Antonio Andreotti, Ralph Andreotti, Chris LaFrancesca, Marie LaFrancesca, Bunilda Litwin, Stuart Litwin, Diane Parrett, Kevin Parrett, George Henges, Nidal Henges, Al Laner, Linda Laner, James Parmiter, Laurie Parmiter, Joseph Palacino, Rose Palacino, Amadeo Pulley, Gina Pulley, Charles Murphy, Joanne Murphy, Christian Sollecito, Elizabeth Sollecito, Dawn Johnstone, John Johnstone, Patricia Loening, William Loening, Mercedes Sumba, Samuel Sumba, Eugene Hipsman, Kathleen Hipsman, Georgina Cabrera, Denise Perez, Felix Perez, Evelyn Riera, Freddie Noboa, Silvia Noboa, William Serpe, Solvieg McAuley, Stacey O'Rourke, Kevin O'Rourke, Alice Norkevich, Frank Norkevich, Joann Mussillo, Joseph Mussillo, Blasina Ortega, Raul Ortega, Catherine Massab, Michael Greene, Jennifer Vowinkel, Lawrence Vowinkel, Brian Glacken, Kimberly Carlo, Peter Carlo, Kevin Calzadilla-Marino, Marisol Calzadilla-Marino, Salvatore Dantone, Frank Stark, Pamela Stark, Conte

Cutting, Sonya Cutting, Evelyn Lillis, Steven Lillis, Charolotte Lipson, Ronnie Lipson, Christine Pierre, Frank Faivre, Maryellen Faivre, Angel Hualpa, John Fiorella, Ana Weeks, Raul Weeks, Andrew Dunaway, Kevin Bartolomew, Maria Bartolomew, Kathleen Dallas, Kevin Dallas, Josephine Genovese, Peter Genovese, Daniel Joyce, Clifford Kartell, Susan Kartell, Edgar Lugo, Minery A. Lugo, Frank McCullagh, Rose McCullagh, Patricia Meade, Rory Meade, Chandidas Potopsingh, Lorraine Potopsingh, Andy Saladeen, Semoy W. Saladeen, Joseph Selesky, Sharon Selesky, Mark Sillaro, Monico Sillaro, Louis Vaccaro, Sean Keary, Daniel Fucella, Maria Fucella, Robert J. McGrory, Houssain Lazaar, James Romano, Jack J. D'Elia, Helene Wolf, Timothy Wolf, Jeff Campion, Jose Polo, Janet M. Kelleher, Michael Kelleher, Daniel Black, Norma Black, Maura Farrell, Robert Farrell. Gregory Harris, Yvonne Harris, Alexander Chorny, Carlton Graham, Kevin Hickey, Rosario Hernandez, Salvatore Fradella, Ralph Carmine, Fran Martin, Luis Maranso, Fred Manzolillo, Thomas Primo, Vito Ribaudo, Luis Ramos, Brian O'Connor, Kathleen O'Connor, Douglas Kenah, Janet Kenah, Andrea Pryce, Mary Ann Thompson, Victor Thompson, Jo Anne Kissane, Patrick Kissane, Michael Chambers, Gerald Hill, Valerie Hill, Dennis Luria, Susan Luria, Anthony Rotondi, Nicoletta Rotondi, Keith Mazzeo, Louis Camerada, Leroy Jonas, Roberta Jonas, Paul Pasqua, Thomas McMahon, Margaret Armagno, Daniel Armagno, Dawn Marie Sorber, Paul Sorber, Scott Lepre, Maria Asher, Thomas Asher, Ivan Petters, Derek Williams, Sharon Williams, Lawrence Wallace, Margaret Wallace, Brian Verardi, Jennifer Verardi, Chyrell Wells, David Wells, Edward Patterson, Patricia Patterson, Tonya Palmer, Carmen Velez, Jimmie White, Vincent Viola, Daine Villa, John Villa, Donna Masseria, Matthew Masseria, John Maglione, Joseph Maglione, Eric Saxon, Gaetano Messina, Maria Messina, Francine McInerney, Timothy McInerney, Donna Loughran, Patricia Loughran, Joseph Bellisimo, John Bianco, Isaac Hernandez, Angel Cruz, Eugene Harris, Yolanda Harris, Carole R. Klein, Glen Klein, Jose Ruiz, Edgardo Collazo, Shante Bueford, Terrance Bueford, Lawrence Bilicki, Mamcyhi Bilicki, Jill Maier, Henry Hachemeister, John Mailot, Tammy Mailot, Eileen

Beaury, William Beaury, Donald Kiniery, Georgene Shanahan, Michael Shanahan, Joseph Hardy, Andrew Powell, Amy Caradonna, Melchiorre Caradonna, Edward R. Pecoroni, June Pecoroni, Michael Basmagy, Barbara Thomas, Jevon Thomas, Kevin P. O'Malley, John Dunne, Marie Barry, Thomas J. Barry, Matthew Mulahm, James F. Albach, Daniel Willett, Lovella Willett, Theresa Cosgrave, Brigid Belford, John Belford, Kevin O'Malley, Philip Duncan, Virginia Duncan, Christopher M. Maloney, Jaqueline Maloney, Jamal Williams, Camile Baker, William Baker, Jenifer Streng, Joseph Streng, Christopher Bacchi, Jose Bacchi, Fred LaFemina, Robin LaFemina, Lisa D. Maitland, Noel Maitland, Cynthia Dellaporta, Michael D. Dellaporta, Judith Longa, Thomas Longa, Julio C. Rosario, April Rojas, Carlos Rojas, Anita Thomson, Dennis Thomson, Arnold Hardman, Sharon T. Hardman, Christopher Ryan, Erin P. Ryan, John Rodelli, Kathy Rodelli, Dorothy Cunningham, Tom Cunningham, Augustine Sciabarassi, Patricia Sciabarassi, James Tierney, Mary Tierney, Thad Todd, Detective, Anthony P. Roy, Donna Roy, Nicholas Morrone, Robert Kenavan, Veronica Kenavan, Ariel James, Ava James, Belinda Gonzalez-Ruane, Tye Butler, Peter Cooper, Maria Cooper, Joseph M. Urso, Bruce Gerrie, Debra A. Gerrie, Kevin Barry, Lorraine Barry, Keith Richards, Teresa Arca, William Ziegelmeir, Patrick Desarlo, Noreen Desarlo, Antoinette Cacovic, Alexander Cacovic, William Geer, Randy S. Brenner, Andrew Porazzo, Pawel Krasko, Denise DeAngelis, Karen Doty, Ricard Doty, James Arca, Marion Slawinski, Marie Slawinski, Joanne William, Dreu Williams, Eugene Dalton, Nan Dalton, Richard Eulie, Yvonne Eulie, Michael Briskie, Silva Briskie, Steven Kepley, Michael Gentile, Nurul Amin, Mark DeMauro, Gina MeMauro, Daphna Blacksea, Victor DiPierro, Lucy DiPierro, Robert Coletti, Phylis Coletti, Marco A. Mendoza, Carolina Mendoza, Peter Tartamella, Frances Tartamella, Michael Sullivan, Jennifer Sullivan, Christopher Wanker, Meghan Wanker, Bill Cavanaugh, Margaret Cavanaugh, Raymond Denninger, Vicki Denninger, Thomas Dawber, Anna-Marie Dawber, Jaime Cruz, Katherine Cruz, Ralph Madonna, Michael Restagno, Maria Restagno, Colin Byrne, Christopher Dowd, Barbara Dowd, Paul Jaeger, Carolyn Jaeger,

Kenneth Quest, Susan Quest, Anna Abad, Aly Abdelrehim, Hala Abdelrehim, Leonard Abruzzese, Caryn Abruzzese, Albert Acierno, Holly Acierno, Peter Acquaro, Kathleen M. Acquaro, Guiseppe Acquista, Robert Adams, Lahissi Adetayo, George Affatato, Lois E. Affatato, Emmanual Agostini, Calogero Agro, Rosa Agro, Carmelo Agro, Steven Agugliardo, Nicole Agugliardo, Robert Aguirre, Patricia Aguirre, Inderpaul Ahluwalia, Manjeet Ahluwalia, Nasar Ahmed, Okpara Akil, Ronnita Akil, Vivencia Alaimo, Serafina Alaimo, Anthony Albert, Sylvester Alexander, Debora Alexander, Victor Alexander, Geraldine Alexander, Jane Alfano, Darren Alicea, Clifford Allen, Josephine Allen, Kevin Allen, June Allison, Raul Allivar, Anthony Alloggio, Catherine Alloggio, Orlando Almodovar, Julio Alonzo, Neil Alper, Jorge E. Alulema, Robert Alvarado, David Alvarado, Sonia Alvarado, Lynn Alvarez, Doria S. Alvarez, Jaime Alvarez, Maria Alvarez, Carlos Alvarez, Saul Alvarez, Santiago Alvear, Jorge Alvlema, Glenda Ammon, Louis Ancona, Anthony Anderson, Orenthal Anderson, Gregory Anderson, Nicole Anderson, Joseph Anderson, Andrea Anderson, Mortimer Anderson, Camile Anderson, Courtney Anderson, Mark Andrus, Pino Anselmo, Rita Anselmo, Stewart Anspach, Nick Antico, Anna Antico, Peter Antienne, Evanie Antine, Richard Antonacci, Robert Anzalone, Ann Marie Anzalone, Joseph Anzueta, Jose Aponte, Noemi Aponte, Vincent Aprea, Krista Aprea, Courtney Aquart, Lillieth Aquart, John Arciuolo, Celia Arciuolo, Arenas Arenas, Jhonson Arichabala, Dagoberto Aristizabal, Alexandra Aristizabal, Enid Aristizabal, Joseph Arlotta, Kimberely Arlotta, Thomas A. Arlotta, Romulo Armas, Claude Armstrong, Laura Armstrong, Danny Aroyo, Theresa Arroyo, Lisa Asaro, Joseph Asciolla, Francine Asciolla, Wilmer Astudillo, Maria I. Astudillo, Marcelo Atiencia, Frank Auditore, John Auer, Jules Auguste, Clyde Augustine, Portia Augustine, Fitzroy Augustus, William Ausby, Thomas Avery, Linda Avery, David Aviles, Anna Aviles, Lawrence Ayers, Patricia Ayers, Victor Azubike, Tekrisha Azubike, Thomas Bacchi, Irene Bacchi, Fabiola Baez, Raul Baez, James Bahrey, Lauranne Bahrey, Santo Baisi, Alfred Baker, Candiace Baker, Chris Balabous, Rosanne Baldo, Krishendath Baliraj, Olga Baliraj, Joseph Barbato, Joseph Barbera,

Virginia Barbosa, Stalin F. Barccoulong, Michael Barker, Raymond Barksdale, Elizabeth Barksdale, Andrew Barone, Ann Marie Barone, Sergio Barragan, James Bartlet, Yudelka Bartlet, Guillermo Barzola, Wilbert Bascom, Setna Bascom, Anthony Basic, Thomas Basmagy, Nancy Basmagy, Harry Bass, Maria L. Bass, Julio Bastidas, Max Bataille, Jr., Linda Battle, Richard Battle, Frank Bauman, Alise L. Bauman, Christopher A. Bauman, Hanfort Bautista, Patrick J. Beatty, James Beck, Christine Beck, Paul Beck, Tinel Bedford, Leonard Beecher, Fanny Beiarano, Theadore Belgrave, Amy Beller, Timothy Bellew, Kathleen A. Bellew, Dimitrios Bellos, Martin Belmonte, Eileen Belmonte, Xavier Beltran, Florinda Benavidez, Lori Bencivenga, Thomas L. Bencivenga, Rose Marie Bencivenga, John Benedetto, Theresa Benedetto, Vinny Benenati, Cindy Benenati, Andrew Benfante, Shirley Benfante, Reynaldo Benitez, Richard Benn, Ann Benn, Carlos Bennett, Donna Bennett, Peter Bergin, Susan Bergin, Erick Bermudez, Frank Beshears, Diane Bethea, Idris Bey, Michael Bianchino, James A. Bianco, Terry Bianco, Vito Bianco, James Bieselin, Lorraine K. Bieselin, Joseph F. Biella, Roseann Bilella, Robert Bilella, Maureen Bilella, Vincent Bilella, Martin Bilinski, Catherine Bilinski, Kampta Bishun, Hassena Bishun, Peter Bishun, Elizabeth Bishun, John Black, Patricia Black, Joseph Black, Veronica E. Black, Leon L. Blackwell, Jorge Blanco, Dora Blanco, Leroy Blount, Eleanore Blount, Thomas Blumbergs, Kevin Bobe, Nicholas P. Bolobanic, Joy H. Bolobanic, Anthony Bombace, Jean Bombace, Jay Bomser, Daniel Bonanno, Frank E. Bondeson, Kathleen Bondeson, Edward Smith, Dennis M. O'Connor, Nicholas Lusuriello, Thomas M. Flanders, 22 Non-Resp, Darlene Montalvo, Paula Raehse, Daniel DeGiovine, Joette DeGiovine, All Plaintiffs, Harold Valencia, Natalie Valencia, Daniel Taylor, Lynn Taylor, Teresa Hartley, Robert Zane, Albert Pearce, Robert Suarez, Antonio E. Alves, plaintiff in matters 05-cv-7266 & 05-cv-2716, Maria E. Alves, plaintiff in matters 05-cv-7266 & 05-cv-2716, Raymond Hauber, in his representative capacity as executor of the Estate of Raymond Hauber, now deceased,

Plaintiffs - Appellees - Cross - Appellants,

v.

City of New York, AMEC Construction Management, Inc., AMEC Earth & Environmental, Inc., Bovis Lend Lease LMB, Inc., Evergreen Recycling of Corona (E.R.O.C.), Turner/Plaza, A Joint Venture, A Russo Wrecking, Inc., Plaza Construction Corp., Atlantic-Heydt Corporation, Tully Construction Co., Inc., Berkel & Company Contractors, Inc., Turner Construction Company, Big Apple Wrecking & Construction Corp., Board of Education of the City of New York, Breeze Carting, Inc., Breeze National, Inc., Brer-Four Transportation, Buro Happold Consulting Engineers, PC, C.B. Contracting Corp., Canron Construction Corp., Component Assembly Systems, Inc., Cord Contracting Co., Inc., Dakota Demo-Tech, Diamond Point Excavating Corporation, Diversified Carting, Inc., DMT Enterprise, Inc., E. J. Davies, Inc., Eagle One Roofing Contractors, Inc., En-Tech Corporation, Ewell W. Finely, P.C., Executive Medical Services, P.C., Fleet Trucking, Inc., Francis A. Lee Company, FTI Trucking Corp., Gilsanz Murray Steficek, LLP, Goldstein Associates Consulting Engineers PC, Hallen Welding Service, Inc., HP Environmental, Inc., Hudson Meridian Construction Group LLC, J.P Equipment & Rental Materials, L.L.C., La Strada General Contracting Corp., Laquila Construction, Inc., Leslie E. Robertson Associates, R.L.L.P., Liberty Mutual Insurance Company, Lockwood Kessler & Bartlett, Inc., Lucius Pitkin, Inc., LZA Technology, a division of Thornton Tomasetti, Manafort Brothers Incorporated, Mazzocchi Wrecking, Inc., Moretrench American Corp., MRA Engineering P.C, Mueser Rutledge Consulting Engineers, Nacirema Industries Inc., New York City Department of Education, New York City School Construction Authority, New York Crane & Equipment Corporation, Nicholson Construction Company, Peter Scalamandre and Sons, Inc, Pinnacle Environmental Corporation, Pro Safety Services Inc., PT&L Contracting Corporation, Robert L. Gerosa, Inc., Robert Silman Associates, P.C., Rodar Enterprises, Inc., Royal GM Inc., SAB Trucking, Inc., Safeway Environmental Corporation, Semcor Equipment & Manufacturing Corporation, Silverite

Contracting Corporation, Simpson Gumpertz & Heger, Inc., Skanska Koch, Inc., Skidmore Owings and Merrill, L.L.P., The City University of New York, Thornton Tomasetti, Inc., Total Safety Consulting, LLC, Tucci Equipment Rental Corporation, Vollmer Associates LLP, Weeks Marine, Inc., Weidlinger Associates P.C., Wolkow Braker Roofing Corporation, WSP Cantor Seinuk, Yannuzzi & Sons, Inc., Yonkers Contracting Company, Inc.,

Defendants - Appellants - Cross - Appellees.

The parties in the above-referenced case have filed a stipulation withdrawing this appeal pursuant to Local Rule 42.1. Each party has submitted a separate electronically signed counterpart reflecting the negotiated terms of the stipulation.

The stipulations are hereby "So Ordered".

For The Court:

Catherine O'Hagan Wolfe, Clerk of Court

Cathering * SECOND * CIRCUIT * CIRCUIT *

A True Copy

Catherine O'Hagan Wolfe Clerk

United States Court of Appeals, Second Circuit